

Presbytery Review Committee

Minutes

April 2023

The General Assembly's Presbytery Review Committee met by web meeting on Thursday, March 2, 2023. The 2023 Committee includes RE Ron Bengelink, RE Jane Bodden, RE Jim Conners, RE Keith Hopkins, RE Ray Kinat, RE George King, RE Bill Myers. TE Jason Steele, and TE Mark Willems were in attendance. As Chair, Ron Bengelink explained the task ahead and the importance of it to both the historical and legal requirements of our EPC denomination. He described the process as well as the time constraints for our task to review and document the corrections or additions to all the 2022 meeting minutes of the sixteen presbyteries now operating in the EPC.

Two members of the Committee will read the minutes of four presbyteries, and each will document their findings of any Exceptions, Notations Requiring a Response, or Notations for each Presbytery. (Although only Exceptions will be reported to the 43rd meeting of the General Assembly, the findings in all three categories will be reported to the office of the Stated Clerk of the EPC.) The Chairman will then participate in a video conference with those two readers with support from the GA office staff, the three will agree on those findings to report for 2023. These video conferences will cover the review of two presbyteries each time and were scheduled on two days each week between March 21 and April 13. All Committee members were instructed to use the recently developed PRC Handbook as the primary resource for identifying possible violations of the **Book of Order**, the *Rules for Assembly*, and the *Acts of the Assembly* during their review. This Handbook has also been made available to all Presbytery Stated Clerks to ensure that both the Presbytery Clerks and the PRC members are using the same expectations for accuracy.

Again, this year, the Committee members were also asked to report the number of churches in each presbytery who had not sent anyone to any of the three Stated Meetings of that presbytery. The members of the Committee were also requested to review the responses from the various presbyteries to those Exceptions cited to them by the 42nd General Assembly regarding their 2021 presbytery minutes.

As a result of this review process, the Committee determined that:

1. After the review of presbytery responses to the Exceptions issued by the 42nd General Assembly in 2022, those responses are recommended by Common Consent to be approved for the cited presbyteries: including:

Alleghenies

Central South

East

Florida & Caribbean

Great Plains

Mid America

Midwest

Pacific NW

Pacific SW

Rivers and Lakes

West (conditional upon the Presbytery Stated Clerk's response to correctional letters from the Chair of the PRC and the Chief Parliamentarian of the EPC)

2. The Committee reports that the case when no representatives from a given church attended any of the Stated Meetings for the year 2022 was lower than that reported in 2021. In 2022 only three presbyteries reported 10% or more churches were not represented at any stated meeting and one (MidAmerica) reported 0% in that category. For the entire denomination the average was 6% (approximately 40) of all churches in the EPC as compared to 11% (just under 70 churches) in 2021.
3. Following is the list of all citations (Exceptions, Notations Requiring a Response, and Notations) for each presbytery.

A. Alleghenies

1. The committee recommends that the Minutes of the Alleghenies Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*.
 - a. No record of annual session records review **G. 19-4A7. Acts of Assembly 07-08.**
 - b. No record of date and time or ordination/installation of: TEs Cepek and Eatough, TEs Shefelton and Hall, TE White, TE Harris (Mtgs 41, 42, & 43, 41-10D, page 736 & 41-17D, page 739 42-10D & 10J, pages 759 & 761 43-19D, page 797 44-15D, page 841) **G. 13-1A, G. 21-1C.2. b.**
 - c. TE David Shrader, an Out of Bounds Chaplain in US Air Force, period of time not recorded. (Mtg 41-10B, page 735) **G. 10-8b.2. a.**
2. The committee will forward the following *notations requiring responses* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Alleghenies Presbytery.
 - a. Descending Overture summary not included (Mtg 41-13C, pages 737-738) *Acts of Assembly 07-08.*
 - b. TE Harper Brady and TE Gary Chorpenning moved to retired roll; no other detail recorded. TE Denny Finnegan moved to the active retired roll; no other details recorded. (Mtg 41-10B, page 735 42-10B, page 759) **G. 15.**
3. The Committee will forward the following *notations* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Alleghenies Presbytery.

None
4. General advice to the presbytery.

None
5. Commendations.
 - a. Minutes are very well organized and easy to follow. Well done!

B. Central Carolinas

1. The committee recommends that the Minutes of the Central Carolinas Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*.
 - a. Call of TE Charles Reed as Assistant Pastor included in Omnibus Motion with no record of exam, duration (term) of call, primary area of responsibility or position on Westminster Standards. (Mtg 01-18.2) **G. 12-2-5, G. 13-1-7.**
 - b. Candidate Howard Quach, Westminster position not recorded (Mtg 01-18.1) **G. 12-4.**
 - c. Minutes not signed by the moderator (Mtg 01) **G. 19-5D.**
2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring responses* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Central Carolinas Presbytery.
 - a. Parity reported but disproportionate numbers of REs not addressed (Mtg 01-08, no page number) **G. 19-2A.4b, Acts of Assembly 05-08.**
 - b. Ministerial Committee Membership not recorded (Mtg 01) **G. 21-2.**

- c. Minutes pages not numbered (Mtg 01) *Acts of Assembly* 98-05 and 05-08 #4, *Acts of Assembly* 16-25
 - d. Recorded an annual session minutes review, however no other details such as which churches are not in compliance (Mtg 01) **G.** 19-4A7.
 - e. No record of the source of the motion (Mtg 01 motion 01-13, 01-17) Robert Rules.
3. The Committee will forward the following **notations** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Central Carolinas Presbytery.
- a. Church Health Coordinator, Presbytery of Florida and the Caribbean is Mark Farrell, not Mike Ferrell. (Mtg 01, 01-09).
 - b. Some ruling elders as unexcused.
 - c. Several teaching elders were listed as N/A 01-No page or minute number *Acts of Assembly* 00-11.
 - d. Instead of using the term N/A in the attendance list for churches with a vacant pulpit, it should be listed as “Vacant”.
4. General advice to the presbytery.
None
5. Commendations
Congratulation on your new Presbytery. Blessings and prayers as you continue with organization and growth.

C. Central South

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Central South Presbytery be approved with the following **exceptions**.
- a. No mention of the membership of the dissolved church being transferred to another church or being held by the Presbytery. (Mtg. 115/956/115.16) **G.** 5-9.
 - b. No definite period listed for TE serving out of bounds. (Mtg. 115/958/115/24) **G.** 10-8 B.2.a.
2. The Committee will forward the following **notations requiring responses** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Central South Presbytery.
- a. Description of Descending Overtures not included when recording a vote. (Mtg. 115/956/11/16) *Acts of Assembly* 07-08.
 - b. No mention of Correspondence. (Mtg 115, 116, 117) *Acts of Assembly* 08-3.
 - c. No mention of Assistant Pastor duties when being renewed (TE David Bo wen). (Mtg 116/977/116.07.3. b. 116/984116.23) **G.** 10-6.
 - d. No mention of additional RE assigned to churches to maintain a 1:2 TE to RE ratio. (Mtg 115, 116, 117) **G.** 19-2 A.4.b. *Acts of Assembly* 05-08 3.f. Page 999 is missing; it goes from 998 to 1000. (Mtg. 117) *Acts of Assembly* 16-25.2.
 - e. No page numbers (Mtg 115)
 - f. Commission reports and other required reports such as Parity Lists, Budget Reports, etc., if included as attachments, are to be included in the minutes numbering sequence and therefore must precede the signature page for those minutes.
3. The Committee will forward the following **notations** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Central South Presbytery.
Misspelled Quorum “Qourum” in section heading (Mtg 115.01/946).
4. General advice to the Presbytery
None

5. Commendations

Overall excellent minutes that tell a wonderful story of love and respect among diverse believers. Prayers and blessings to your Presbytery.

D. Coastal Mid-Atlantic

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Coastal Mid-Atlantic Presbytery be approved with the following **exceptions**.
 - a. Called Presbytery meeting minutes of June 14 were approved. No minutes for the June 14 called meeting were submitted for review. (Mtg. #1, page 1, section 1.06) **G. 19-5D, Rules for Assembly 9-12G.1.**
 - b. “Parity” report simply listed the count of TEs, REs attending the current meeting. No list of churches invited to send additional REs (Mtg #1, page 3, section 1.15) **G. 19-2A.4b Acts of Assembly 05-08.**
 - c. The report stated that a list of churches who had submitted Session Minutes was presented but the list was not included in minutes. (Mtg 100, page 638, Stated Clerk Report) **G. 19-4A7** requires reviewed. **G. 19-4A7, Acts of Assembly 07-08.**
 - d. Date and time were not given for the installation of the Pastor of the Newly established Restoration Community Church (Mtg 100, page 639, first paragraph) **G. 13-1A, G. 21-1C.2. b.**
 - e. Change of call to Out-of-Bounds, no term was listed (Mtg 101, page 665, section 101.59.3C **G. 10-8B2, Acts of Assembly 05-08.**
 - f. The calling of an Assistant Pastor did not list the duration of the call (Mtg 101, page 666, section 101.60). Assistant Pastor Josh Schatzle, no duration of call recorded (Mtg 101.58, page 665 **G.10-6A**) Assistant Pastor Matt Hartman, no duration of call record (Mtg 001.28, page 7) **G. 10-6A.**
 - g. No record of candidates’ position on Westminster Confession. (Mtg 001.28, page 7) **G. 12-4.**
 - h. Candidate Drew Daniels was ordained by the Presbytery at the meeting. No record of installation plans for others. (Mtg 001-29, page 7) **G. 13-1A.**
 - i. TE Mark Hunt, laboring Out of Bounds: No duration of call recorded 1 (Mtg 01-59-3C, page 665) **G. 10-8B.2a.**
 - j. Candidates Katie Macturk and Noah Austin, no mention of Session endorsement (Mtg 101.57, page 664) **G. 11-2A.**
2. The Committee will forward the following **notations requiring responses** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Coastal Mid-Atlantic Presbytery.
 - a. Time of call to order and time of adjournment not recorded (Mtg. 001.01, page 1) **Rules for Assembly 9-12G.1.**
 - b. Opening prayer recorded, closing prayer not recorded (Mtg 001.03, page 1, 8) **Rules for Assembly 9-12G.2.**
 - c. Churches with no representation were listed as absent, with no TE name shown. Page 625 shows excused TEs but no church affiliation. (Mtg. 100, pages 616, 617, 629, 635, & 636) **Rules for Assembly 9-12G.1.**
 - d. Churches with no representation were listed as absent, with no TE name shown. (Mtg 101.34, pages 655, 656, 657, 658, 659) **Rules for Assembly 9-12G.1.**
 - e. Only TEs in attendance listed 1 (Mtg 01.67, pages 668, 669, 670, 671) **Rules for Assembly 9-12G.1.**

- f. Only TEs in attendance listed (Mtg 001, pages 10-11) *Rules for Assembly* 9-12G.1.
 - g. Names of churches submitting and not submitting minutes were read, but the minutes do not record the churches' names. (Mtg 100, page 638) *Acts of Assembly* 07-8.1.
 - h. No summary of Descending Overture included (Mtg 100, page 632) *Acts of Assembly* 07-08.
 - i. An Associate Pastor moved to Pastor of the same church. $\frac{3}{4}$ vote of Session and Ministerial Committee was not recorded. (Mtg. 101, page 665, section 101-59.3H) **G.** 10-4D.
3. The Committee will forward the following **notations** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Coastal Mid-Atlantic Presbytery.
 - a. Voted on Overture 21 A, B, C, D, E but did not include a summary of the Overtures voted on. (Mt. 100, page 623, second from last paragraph) (Mtg 100, page 632, 4th paragraph 100, page 638, next to last paragraph) *Acts of Assembly* 07-08.
 4. General advice to the presbytery.
 - a. None
 5. Commendations
 - a. None

E. East

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the East Presbytery be approved with the following **exceptions**.
 - a. Minutes must report the membership of the Presbytery's Ministerial Committee at its first meeting each year to define for that year that its ratio of Teaching Elders to Ruling Elders meets the requirements of **G.** 21-2 for that Committee. (Mtg 124.17, 001274) **G.** 21-2.
 - b. No mention of Circleville commission being dismissed (Mtg 126, 126/1401/26-17) **G.** 21-1 Judicial Committee comments from last year.
 - c. No statement of primary responsibilities for renewing an Assistant Pastor. (Mtg 126, 126/1423/126-36L) **G.** 10-6A.
 - d. No statement of primary responsibilities for Associate Pastor that was previously an Assistant Pastor (Mtg 126, 126/1423/126-36N) **G.** 10-6A.
2. The Committee will forward the following **notations requiring responses** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the East Presbytery.

Minute pages do not appear to be numbered consecutively from meeting to meeting 124, 125, 126 Presbytery Minutes pages shall be consecutively numbered in their permanent record. *Acts of Assembly* 16-25.
3. The Committee will forward the following **notations** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the East Presbytery.

Attendees were listed as Present or Absent, none Excused even though there are lists of those that said they would be absent. (p. 124/1274 & 1268, 125 / 1361 & 1377, 126 /1396 & 1408) *Acts of Assembly* 00-11b.
4. General advice to the presbytery.
 - None
5. Commendations

Very detailed Independent Financial Review of the Financial Records of the POE for 2020 and 2021. As a presbytery, you truly honor those who have served and are retiring, either from full time ministry or as leadership in the POE. Very detailed reporting of Review of Session Minutes by the Session Records Review sub-team. The proposed Ascending Overture to GA regarding a Required Mentoring Internship component. 126-36D, 001417.

F. Florida & Caribbean

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Florida and the Caribbean Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*.
 - a. No Quorum declared, even though it is in the Section heading. (Mtg 96 & 97, page 96/1/96.01, 97/197.01) **G.** 19-5C.
 - b. No mention of additional RE assigned to churches to maintain a. 1:2 TE to RE ratio. (Mtg 95, 96, 97) **G.** 19-2 A.4. *Acts of Assembly* 05-08 3. 96. No list of specific areas of responsibility for Associate Pastor (Carlos Sierra) (Mtg 96, page 10/96-10) **G.** 10-5.
 - c. No record of Session minutes being reviewed for each church by name. (Mtg 95, 96, 97) **G.** 19-4 A.7. *Acts of Assembly* 07-08.
2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring responses* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Florida & Caribbean Presbytery.
 - a. No page numbers (Mtg 95) *Acts of Assembly* 98-05, 05-08 #4, 16-25.
 - b. Pages numbered from 1, not consecutively numbered from the permanent record. (Mtg 95) *Acts of Assembly* 98-05, 05-08 #4, 16-25.
 - c. Minutes not signed by either Moderator or Clerk (Mtg 96th, page. 17, 97th page 14).
3. The Committee will forward the following *notations* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Florida and the Caribbean Presbytery.

Misspelled word “notions” should be “motions”, (Mtg 96, 1st line, 2nd paragraph, page 7).
4. General advice to the presbytery.

None
5. Commendations
 - a. Very good church attendance at the Presbytery Meetings. Well done and may the Lord bless you.

G. Great Plains

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Great Plains Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*.
 - a. TE Ken Ferguson: Assistant Pastor position requires call to be for a definite period of time, none shown (Mtg 25.07-2, page 575, 576, **G.** 10-6A.
 - b. TE Josh Weeks, Call as Associate Pastor approved but does not stipulate areas of responsibility as required. (Mtg 26.03-B.4, page 582) **G.** 10-5.
 - c. TE Timothy Janiszewski; No duration (term) of call specified, as required for an Out of Bounds call (Mtg 27.04-1, page 601) **G.** 10-8. B2a.
2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring responses* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Great Plains Presbytery.

- a. No summary of Descending Overture included (Mtg 25.05-5, page 572) *Acts of Assembly* 07-08-3.
 - b. New Covenant Presbytery Church and their Pastor TE Craig Waetke were acknowledged as having been dismissed by the PCUSA Presbytery of Southern Kansas and by action of the Executive Council received as Transition members of Great Plains Presbytery on November 17, 2021. No record of the church being received at a Presbytery Meeting or anything beyond “transitional members”. (Mtg 25.05-1, page 571) **G.** 5-6.
 - c. Candidate Connor Young’s Pastor, TE Jonatan Buisch, was named as his advisor. (Mtg 26.13-B.6, page 589) **G.** 11-2E, *Acts of Assembly* 06-08-1.
3. The Committee will forward the following **notations** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Great Plains Presbytery.
- a. Attendance lists are well organized and clear, with one exception. Rather than using “E” for Excused and “U” for Unexcused, anyone not present is listed as “ab” followed by a single letter code explaining the absence. The codes are explained at the bottom of the page. (Mtg. 25, pages 566-571, 26, pages 579-582, 27, pages 591-594) *Acts of Assembly* 00-11.2.
 - b. “Approve Colonial Presbyterian Church *confirming* Associate Pastor Emeritus status upon TE Bob Lehlietner.” *Conferring* seems a more appropriate word. (Mtg. 26-02. F-11, page 578) **G.** 15-3.
 - c. The report listed churches whose Session minutes had been received but not *reviewed* (27th meeting, September 23, page 602, section 27.09 session records report) *Acts of Assembly* 07-08.1.
 - d. Minutes included “Approved the GPP Parity for 2022” but did not list the churches that were requested to send additional REs (25th meeting, January 28, page 566, section 25.02 Administrative Actions, item 8) *Acts of Assembly* 05-08.
 - e. Minutes included that Session records were reviewed (report received) but didn’t list churches reviewed (25th meeting, January 28, page 566, section 25.02 Administrative Actions, item 6) *Acts of Assembly* 07-08.1.
4. General advice to the presbytery.
None
5. Commendations
- a. The minutes are clear and for the most part easy to follow.
 - b. Corrected parity omission from last year’s exception, list of churches which submitted minutes, included start time in all minutes and listed members of the Ministerial Committee. Well done!

H. Gulf South

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Gulf South Presbytery be approved with the following **exceptions**.
 - a. No mention that Congregation of Faith Vietnamese Mission Church voted to dissolve (Mtg 23, page 23/93/23.22 1) **G.** 5-9.
 - b. No mention of how the property of Faith Vietnamese Mission Church was disposed of. (Mtg 23.23/93/23.22 1) **G.** 5-9.
2. The Committee will forward the following **notations requiring responses** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Guld South Presbytery.
 - a. TE Trafford moved that the congregation be received as a transitional member of the Presbytery. (Mtg 23. 23-96) *Acts of Assembly* 14-13. “The Assembly extended

- the provision adopted by the 27th General Assembly to receive ministers and churches as transitional members only to December 31, 2019”.
- b. Financial Reporting. While there is reference to Income and Expenses, there is no reference to: Balance Sheet, Audited or Reviewed Financial Statements for Mtg. 23, 24, & 25) *Acts of Assembly* 07-09.
 - c. Presbytery Minutes pages shall be consecutively numbered in their permanent records. Both the 24th and 25th Stated Meetings begin with the same page number. *Acts of Assembly* 16-25.
 - d. Budget Appendix was not attached to the minutes (Mtg 23, 97/23.27) *Rules for Assembly* IX 9-12 G. 15.
 - e. No indication that members of the Church of the Resurrection petitioned Presbytery to become a Local Church (Mtg 25 / 106/25.10) **G. 5-5A.**
3. The Committee will forward the following ***notations*** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Gulf South Presbytery.
 - a. None
 4. General Advice to the presbytery.
 - a. None
 5. Commendations
 - a. Minutes are well organized and easy to read. Enjoyed the poetic reflections at the end of the 25th meeting page 25 / 118-120 /24.22.

I. Mid-America

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Mid-America Presbytery be approved with the following ***exceptions***.
Terms of call must state length of term for Assistant Pastors. (Mtg 94-11/1392-94 item 1) **G. 10-5, 10-6.**
2. The Committee will forward the following ***notations requiring responses*** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Mid-America Presbytery.
Commission reports and other required reports such as Parity Lists, Budget reports, etc., if included as Attachments, must be included in the numbering sequence of the minutes, and must precede the signature page for those minutes.
Mtg. 92, 93, and 94, **G 19-4C.4 G 19-5D**
3. The Committee will forward the following ***notations*** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Mid-America Presbytery.
None
4. General advice to the presbytery
None
5. Commendations
Exceptional minutes, well organized and easy to read.

J. Midwest

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Midwest Presbytery be approved with the following ***exceptions***.
 - a. Item 6 – Although “All members of Grace Chapel who wish to do so will have their membership transferred to Ward Church.” The minutes did not include the statement that all others membership would be held by the presbytery until their requested transfer. (Mtg 175, page 12-13, section 175-18) **G. 5-9.**

- b. The report on an Executive Session included the fact that Motions were made and passed and are available in the Stated Clerk's office. There is no provision in the EPC Constitution for maintaining a second ("secret") set of Minutes. While discussions may be had in Executive Session, motions must be made in the open session. A person's identity may be protected, if need be, by referring to him/her as TE "X" or RE "B" (Mtg. 177, section 09, page 14) **G. 2-4A.**
 2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring responses* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Midwest Presbytery.
 - a. No audited/reviewed final financial report at the first Stated meeting of the following year (Mtg 175, page 7, section 175-06) *Rules for Assembly IX 9-12 G. 16.*
 - b. Minutes are to include a section on "Correspondence" in their minutes with dates on which official correspondence is received and sent *Acts of Assembly 03-04.*
 - c. "The call of TE Brian Guinto be changed from Associate Pastor to Pastor of New City EPC." Did not include that a Church Search Committee requested this, and a notation that $\frac{3}{4}$ of the Ministerial Committee and $\frac{3}{4}$ of the Session voted for this (Mtg. 177, page 13, section "Additional Motions from Ministerial Committee") **G. 10-4D.**
 3. The Committee will forward the following *notations* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Midwest Presbytery.
 - a. Minutes pages are not consecutively numbered. Only the first page was numbered 336, other pages were numbered 1 through 17. (Mtg 175, 176, 177, all pages and sections) *Acts of Assembly 16.25.*
 - b. No consistency in reporting "**Book of Order**" Citations (Mt 176-09, 8 & 9) specifically and all 3 meetings generally read "BoG"; "BOG"; "Book of Government".
 - c. Section 175-18, item 7 reads "The Council of the MWP moves that the *Better Together* proposal be approved by the MWP so that a new work known as Ward Church Farmington Hills may be established in Farmington Hills, MI for the purpose of fulfilling the Great Commission." Did not explain what "Better Together" was. What did Presbytery actually approve? (Mtg 175, page 12, 13, section 175-18) **G. 19-5D.**
 - d. A TE moved to the Retired Roll, but no service of appreciation or recognition was recorded. (Mtg 176, page 8, section 176.09) **G. 15-1B.**
 4. General advice to the presbytery
 - a. None
 5. Commendations
 - a. Member church attendance at Stated Meetings has greatly improved. 177th Meeting included Parity List.
 - b. Suggestions: "Approval of written reports, such as Finance, is not appropriate since the general Presbytery does not have the detailed information for an informed decision to "approve" the contents of these reports. Adoption or Reception of these reports would be appropriate. (Mtg 175, page 6, section 175-06, 176, page 7, section 176-06, 177, page 7, section 177-06).

K. New River

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the New River Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*.
None
2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring responses* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the New River Presbytery.
TEs not in attendance listed as absent. Not excused or unexcused as required by *Acts of Assembly* 001-4/1-4/1. *Acts of Assembly* 00-11.
3. The Committee will forward the following *notations* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the New River Presbytery.
None
4. General advice to the presbytery
None
5. Commendations
The minutes of the New River Presbytery 001 are written with exceptional clarity and organization.

L. Pacific Northwest

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Pacific Northwest Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*.
 - a. Listed 14 churches whose Session minutes were due to be reviewed and recorded that 8 had been reviewed but didn't say which 8. (Mtg 14, page 274, section 14-8) **G** 19-4A7 *Acts of Assembly* 07-08.1
 - b. There was a verbal? Report of "Session Minutes reviewed to date" and a list of churches scheduled to be reviewed in Oct, but no list of churches that had been reviewed. **G**. 19-4A7. *Acts of Assembly* 07-08 Must list the churches, by name, who have had their Session minutes reviewed. (Mtg 15, page 8, section 15-7) **G**. 19-4A7. *Acts of Assembly* 07-08.
2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring responses* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Pacific Northwest Presbytery.
None
3. The Committee will forward the following *notations* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Pacific Northwest Presbytery.
Minutes pages are not consecutively numbered (continuing from previous meeting). (Mtg. 15, 11l pages and sections) *Acts of Assembly* 16-25.

M. Pacific Southwest

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Pacific Southwest Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*.
Lacking the list of commissioners and date for installation for Candidate Wright (Mtg 13, page 158, section 13-10). Minutes must report that the Court approved the date and time of both ordinations and installations, as well as the specific members of the appointed Administrative Commission by their office and church affiliation. All such Commissions must include at least five members with Ruling Elders representing at least two member churches. **G**. 13-1A. **G**. 21-1C2. b.

2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring responses* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Pacific Southwest Presbytery.
 - None
3. The Committee will forward the following *notations* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Pacific Southwest Presbytery.
 - None.
4. General advice to the presbytery
 - None
5. Commendations
 - Excellent organization and consistency of minutes taking.

N. Rivers and Lakes

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Rivers and Lakes Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*.
 - a. None
2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring responses* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Rivers and Lakes Presbytery.
 - a. Summary of Descending Overtures not included in minutes. (Mtg 34, page 562) *Acts of Assembly 07-08*.
 - b. The Parity Chart for Min Com is referenced, but not included in the minutes. (Mtg. 35, page 570) **G. 19-2A.4b**.
 - c. Budget for 2023 is not labeled as such (Mtg 36, page 594) *Rules for Assembly 9-12 G.15*.
3. The Committee will forward the following *notations* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Rivers and Lakes Presbytery.
 - a. Min Com was granted authority to install TEs Curtis and Garner “at a future agreed upon date.” The subsequent report of the makeup and actions of the appointed commission should have been reported in the minutes of the following meeting. (Mtg 34, page 563, Curtis; Mtg 35, page 572, Garner) Robert’s Rules of Order.
4. General advice to the presbytery
 - a. None
5. Commendations
 - a. All minutes reviewed were clear and easy to follow.

O. Southeast

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Southeast Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*.
 - a. Terms of Call for assistant did not specify period of time. (Mtg 117, pages 189-190, section 117-18.9, Mtg 117, pages 191-192, section 117-18.10) **G. 10-5, 10-6**.
 - b. No advisor for Candidate Long is named. (Mtg 115, page 124) **G. 11-2E**.
 - c. Length and boundaries of call for CPs Hawkins and Hodges are not given. (Mtg 116, pages 152-153, pages 153-154) **G. 9-11A**.
2. The Committee will forward the following *exceptions requiring responses* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Southeast Presbytery.

- a. Minutes state that an Advisor for Candidate Barnett is “to be appointed by Ministerial Care Committee.” No record of appointment found in subsequent minutes. (Mtg 116, page 149) **G.** 9-11D.
 - b. Length of Out of Bounds calls for TEs Ferguson and Gregory are not indicated. (Mtg 117, page 183) **G.** 10-8B.2a.
3. The Committee will forward the following *notations* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Southeast Presbytery.
 - None
 4. General advice to the presbytery
 - None
 5. Commendations
 - Minutes are well done. I particularly appreciated the attachments being included in the minutes.

P. West

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the West Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*.
 - a. No list of TEs attending, excused, or unexcused. (Mtg 125, page 1) Minutes shall list the names of each Teaching Elder member of the Presbytery and note that person’s attendance as present, excused, or unexcused. *Acts of Assembly* 00-11.
 - b. No list of RE commissioners attending (Mtg 125, page 1, section 125.4) Minutes shall list the names of all Ruling Elders serving as Commissioners for each Church. Minutes shall also list all visiting Teaching Elders and Ruling Elders who have been enrolled as corresponding members with the privilege of the floor. *Acts of Assembly* 03-04.4.
 - c. No record of Associate Members and their attendance at the meeting. (Mtg 125, page 1, section 125.4) Presbytery Minutes shall record the roll of Associate Members and their attendance at meetings. *Acts of Assembly* 16-25.
 - d. No notation of advisors appointed for candidates Chad Johnson and John MacCarthy noted (Mtg. 125, page 3, section 125.11.II) Advisor assigned to candidate (**G.** 11-2E) Presbyteries must follow the provision of **G.**11-2E, namely that the advisor of a candidate coming under care should not ordinarily be the candidate’s pastor. *Acts of Assembly* 06-08.
 - e. No notation of closing prayer for the Presbytery meeting. (Mtg 125, page 4, section 1125.16) Minutes shall report that the meeting was opened and closed with prayer. **G.** 16-1A.
 - f. Notation of TEs, REs and the rest present, however no notation of excused or unexcused absences for TEs not present (Mtg 126, page 4, section 126.20) Minutes shall list the names of each Teaching Elder member of the Presbytery and note that person’s attendance as present, excused, or unexcused. *Acts of Assembly* 00-11.
 - g. No notation of exceptions or no exceptions to WCF noted or approved for Mr. Hubbard. (Mtg 126, page 6, section 126.7) Minutes must report that the examination of all Teaching Elders for ordination and /or installation shall include an approval of that person’s position with respect to the Westminster Standards – either with no stated exceptions or an acceptance of any stated exception(s). These exception(s) are not recorded in the Minutes. **G.** 12-4. *Acts of Assembly* 03-04.

- h. Membership of the Ministerial Committee is not shown to verify the TE/RE ratio for that Committee is 50/50. (Mtg 125, February 2022) **G.** 12-21.
 - i. Summary of each Descending Overture is not included. (Mtg 125.8, February 2022, page 2). **G.** 19-4C2, *Acts of Assembly* 07-08.
 - j. 2022 budget was approved, but not included in the minutes. (Mtg 125.15, February 2022, page 5). *Rules for Assembly* IX 9-12 **G.**16.
 - k. A list of TEs absent either excused or unexcused is not included. (Mtg 126.6.B, May 2022, page 5) *Acts of Assembly* 00-11.
 - l. Inadequate examination description for TE Rohrbach (Mtg 126.10, May 2022, page 7. **G.** 12-3.
 - m. The content of the examination of Candidate Pent was not included in the minutes. (Mtg 127.9A, October 2022, page 6. **G.** 12-2B.
 - n. The content of the examination of TE Smith was not included in the minutes. (Mtg 127.11A, October 2022, page 8. **G.** 12-2B.
 - o. The content of the examination of RE Pettus was not included in the minutes. (Mtg 127.11B, October 2022, pages 8-9) **G.**11-A.
 - p. No review of Session Minutes is shown by Church (Mtgs 125, 126, 127) **G.** 19-4A.7, *Actos of Assembly* 07-08
 - q. Parity List for 2022 not shown in the Minutes. (Mtgs 125, 126, 127) **G.** 19-2a.4b.
 - r. No starting time recorded. (Mtgs 125, 127) **G.** 19-5A.
 - s. Annual (proposed, approved, or status) Budget is not shown in any of the 2022 minutes. (Mtg 124 (from previous year), 125, 126, 127) Minutes must report the approved annual budget, related financial reports at each Sated Meeting, and the audited /reviewed final report at the first Stated Meeting of the following year. *Rules for Assembly* IX 9-12**G.**16.
2. The Committee will forward the following ***notations requiring responses*** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the West Presbytery.
 - a. Omnibus motion – Treasure’s financial information for the first quarter of 2022 (Mtg 126, page 5, section 126.6.C)
 - b. Presbytery minutes pages shall be consecutively numbered in their permanent record. The pages in meetings 125, 126, and 127 were numbered starting at 1 in each meeting. *Acts of Assembly* 16-25.
 - c. A list of TEs absent either excused or unexcused is not included in the minutes. (Mtg126.6B, 2022 page 5) *Acts of Assembly* 00-11.
 - d. The content of the examination of Candidate Pent was not included in the minutes. (Mtg 127.9A, October 2022, page 6) **G.** 12-2B.
 - e. The content of the examination of TE Smith was not included in the minutes. (Mtg 127.11A, October 2022, page 8) **G.** 12-2B.
 - f. The content of the examination of RE Petus was not included in the minutes (Mtg 127.11B, October 2022, pages 8-9) **G.** 12-2B.
 - g. The names of nominees, the positions for which they were nominated, and the length of term to be served were not included in the Nominating Committee report. (Mtg. 127.8, October 2022, page 6) **G.** 21-2.
 3. The Committee will forward the following ***notations*** Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the West Presbytery.

It would be easier to read who was present, absent, visitors, retired, etc., if they were separated into groups for attendance. (Mtg. 126 & 127, 126.2 & 127.2)

4. General Advice to the presbytery

None

5. Commendations

None

4. Committee Members for the Presbytery Review Committee for the 2023 include:

RE Ron Bengelink, Committee Chair	Presbytery of the Pacific Northwest
RE Jane Bodden	Presbytery of Florida & the Caribbean
RE Jim Conners	Presbytery of the Pacific Southwest
RE Keith Hopkins	Presbytery of the Pacific Northwest
RE Ray Kinat	Presbytery of the Alleghenies
RE George King	Presbytery of the Gulf South
RE Bill Myers	Presbytery of the Pacific Southwest
TE Jason Steele	Presbytery of the Midwest
TE Mark Willems	Presbytery of the Pacific Northwest

5. The Committee reviewed and approved these minutes on April 25, 2023.