

Presbytery Review Committee
Minutes
April 2025

The General Assembly's Presbytery Review Committee met by web meeting on Friday, March 7, 2025. The 2025 Committee included RE Ron Bengelink, RE Jane Bodden, RE Jim Connors, RE Keith Hopkins, RE Ray Kinat, RE George King, TE Jason Steele and TE Mark Willems. As Chair, Ron Bengelink explained the task ahead and the importance of it to both the historical and legal requirements of our EPC denomination. He described the process, as well as the time constraints, for our task to review and document the corrections or additions to all of the 2024 meeting minutes of the sixteen presbyteries now operating in the EPC.

Two members of the Committee will read the minutes of four presbyteries, and each will document their findings of any ***Exceptions, Notations Requiring a Response***, or ***Notations*** for each Presbytery. Although only Exceptions will be reported to the 45th meeting of the General Assembly, the findings in all three categories will be reported to the office of the Stated Clerk of the EPC. The Chair will then participate in a video conference with those two readers and, with support from the GA office staff, the three will agree on those findings to report for 2025. These video conferences will cover the review of two presbyteries each time and are scheduled on two days each week between March 18 and April 10. All Committee members were instructed to use the recently developed PRC Handbook as the primary resource for identifying possible violations of the *Book of Order*, the *Rules for the Assembly*, and the *Acts of the Assembly* during their review. This Handbook has also been made available to all Presbytery Stated Clerks to ensure that both the Presbytery Clerks and the PRC members are using the same set of expectations for the accuracy of those Minutes.

This year, the Chair requested each reader to review and document the number of churches in each presbytery who had not sent any required representatives to any of the three Stated Meetings of that presbytery in 2024. The Chair also requested each reader to review the responses from the various presbyteries to those Exceptions cited to them by the 44th General Assembly regarding their 2023 presbytery minutes.

As a result of this review process, the Committee determined that:

1. After the review of presbytery responses to the Exceptions issued by the 44th General Assembly in 2024, those responses are recommended by Common Consent to be approved for the cited presbyteries, including:

Alleghenies
Central Carolina
Central South
Coastal Mid Atlantic
East
Florida & Caribbean

Great Plains
Gulf South
Midwest
Pacific NW
West

2. The Committee reports that the situation when **no** representatives from a given church attended any of the Stated Meetings for the year 2024 was only slightly lower than that reported in 2021 and at 10% was higher than that reported last year.
3. The Committee reports the specific findings for the submitted Minutes of each Presbytery in their 2024 Stated Meetings as follows.

Alleghenies

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Presbytery of the Alleghenies be approved with the following **exceptions**:
 - a. Assistant Pastor Wes Piel – term not specified. 50, p. 1085, 13C, **G.** 10-5, 10-6, *Acts of Assembly* 02-04.
 - b. Assistant Pastor Aaron Badenhop – term not specified. Assistant Pastor Rob Peterson – term not specified 51, p. 1151, 19B, C5, p. 1223, 09A. **G.** 10-5, 10-6, *Acts of Assembly* 02-04.
 - c. Aaron Badenhop-no ordination date recorded, Elija Bombeck - no ordination date recorded, Rob Peterson, Mark Simonds and David O’Leary - no ordination date recorded. 51, p. 1151, p. 1153, 19B and 19G, C5, p. 1224, 09D, **G.** 13-1A. **G.** 21-1C.2.b.
 - d. No term specified for OOB call, TE Brian Carpenter. 49, p. 1041, 10A-2nd bullet point, 50, p. 1083, 13A, **G.** 10-8B.2a
2. The Committee will forward the following **notations requiring response** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Alleghenies Presbytery.
 - a. Mountville listed, but no attendance nor vacancy noted. 50, p. 1091, Attachment A, *Acts of Assembly* 00-11
 - b. Should read “The MC recommend Mr. Bombeck to accept a call from the Mountville EPC Session” (rather than Mr. Brown). 51, p.1152, line 3, **G.** 12-2 through 5, **G.** 13- 1 through 7, **G.** 19-4B1-7, **G.** 21-1A.2 and **G.** 21-1C.2.b.
3. The Committee will forward the following **notations** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Alleghenies Presbytery.
 - a. Spelling of DeNardo and DiNardo. 50, p.1086, 13F
4. General advice to the presbytery
None
5. Commendations
Overall, well done. The exceptions noted were in the same areas for the most part.
Thank you for using the clerk handbook, it made our review much easier.

Central Carolinas

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Presbytery of the Central Carolinas be approved with the following **exceptions**:
 - a. Candidate Drew McCarty’s position on Westminster not recorded. 5, no p.#, 19, **G.** 12-4.
 - b. Candidate Katie Piquette – no period of time recorded. Candidates Eric Bartel and Joe Carvajal - no period of time recorded. 6, no p.#, 26, 7, no p.#, 16:3e & f. **G.** 10-8B.2a.

- c. No details for retiring pastors TE Rob Chambers and TE Steve Wilkinson. 6, no p.#, 27, **G.** 14-1, **G.** 15.
 - d. No inactive roll listed. 5/6/7, **G.** 19-2. *Acts of Assembly* 05-08.
- 2. The Committee will forward the following ***notations requiring response*** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Central Carolinas Presbytery.
 - a. Pages not numbered. 5/6/7, *Acts of Assembly* 98-05 and 05-08 #4 *Acts of Assembly* 16-25.
- 3. The Committee will forward the following ***notations*** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Central Carolinas Presbytery.
 - a. Typo: 454th General Assembly, January 25, 20254, The motion was not read as follows. 7, no p.#, 05, 06, and 07.
- 4. General advice to the presbytery
None
- 5. Commendation
Overall, very well done. Thank you for using the clerk handbook. It made our review much easier.

Central South

- 1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Presbytery of the Central South be approved with the following ***exceptions***:
 - a. No defined time period for TE Wayne Denny, TE John Richards, and TE Dennis Hermerding serving out of bounds. Mtg. 121, p.1073, 121.09 5.c, Mtg. 122, p.1094, 122.08 3.d, Mtg. 122, p. 1113, 122.23. **G.** 10-8.B.2.a.
 - b. No specific duties listed for TE Sir Gregory Thornton and TE Eli Morris as Associate Pastor. Mtg. 121, p.1074, 121.09 5.h, Mtg. 123, p.1121, 123.07 4.b. **G.** 10-5
 - c. No defined time period for TE Hannah Attaway as Assistant Pastor. Mtg. 121, p.1080, 121.10. **G.** 10-6.A
 - d. No specific duties listed for TE David Bowen as Assistant Pastor even though it is a renewal. Mtg. 122, p.1094, 122.08 3.b. **G.** 10-6.A
 - e. No specific duties listed for the following Assistant Pastors even though they are renewals: Brett Wynne, Barton Kimbrough, Will Weir and Greg Aydt. Mtg. 123, p.1121, 123.07 4.d-g. **G.**10-6.A.
 - f. No defined time period for TE Damon Conley as Assistant Pastor. Mtg. 123, p.1146, 123.20. **G.** 10-6.A.
 - g. No listing of additional RE representatives allocated to churches to maintain a 1:2 ratio of TEs to REs. Mtg. 121, Mtg. 122, and Mtg. 123. **G.** 19-2A.4.b, *Acts of Assembly* 05-08
- 2. The Committee will forward the following ***notations requiring response*** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Central South Presbytery.
 - a. Session minutes review does not list which churches have been reviewed or not reviewed. Mtg. 122, p.1101, 122.08. *Rules for Assembly* 9-12 **G.** 9, *Acts of Assembly* 07-8.1
 - b. No mention that TE Noah Kiser's Pastoral relationship with 1st Presbyterian Opelika was dissolved at a Congregation Meeting. It is implied but not stated. Mtg. 121, p.1073, 121.09 5.f. **G.** 14-1.B

3. The Committee will forward the following *notations* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Central South Presbytery.
None
4. General advice to the presbytery
None
5. Commendation
Overall. Nicely done.

Coastal Mid-Atlantic

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Coastal Mid-Atlantic Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*.
 - a. This section was a narrative of the finances of the Presbytery. No tabular finance report was included. Also, no budget was included. Also, no audit or review of the financials was included. Mtg. 5, p.7, 1.12, Mtg. 6, p.6, 1.19. *Rules for Assembly* IX 9-12 **G. 15**. See also Attachment #10 of the Stated Clerk's Handbook for further details.
 - b. Candidate for transfer TE Michael Johnson (from RCA). His exception to Westminster was detailed in the minutes. Mtg. 5, p.8, 1.14.02. The 'Handbook' item 18 says "exception(s) are not recorded in the Minutes. **G. 12-4**". In fact, **G. 12-4** says "the Presbytery shall act to allow or disallow the exceptions". Unless this has been specifically delegated the Ministerial Committee, the Presbytery would need to know what the TE's exception is, in order to allow or disallow it (but the exception still doesn't need to be recorded).
 - c. There was no listing of attendees – TEs or RE's. Excused TE's were listed but their church was not recorded. Mtg. 5, Mtg. 6, Mtg. 5, p.8, 1.15.03, Mtg. 6, p.4, 1.17.01. *Acts of Assembly* 00-11. Clerk's Handbook, items 4 & 5.
 - d. No record of Session Minutes reviewed. Mtg. 5, Mtg. 6, Mtg. 7. **G. 19-4A7**, *Acts of Assembly* 07-08.
 - e. Membership of the Presbytery's Ministerial Committee at its first meeting each year was not recorded. Mtg. 5, Mtg. 6, Mtg. 7. **G. 21-2**.
 - f. Minutes did not include a date for installation of TE Michael Johnson, or where he is to be installed (they did say as Assistant Pastor). Mtg 5, p.8, 1.14.04. **G. 13**.
 - g. Parity: approved that Churches may field three (3) RE per TE. Did not list churches to send 3 RE's, apparently intended to mean every church in the Presbytery. Mtg 6, p.2, 1.07. *Acts of Assembly* 05-08.3, **G. 19-2A.4b**.
 - h. Ascending Overture: There was a vote to concur (which failed) with another church's Ascending Overture – but no summary of the overture was recorded. (Votes were recorded) Mtg. 6, p.3, 1.11. **G. 19-4C2**, *Acts of Assembly* 07-08.
 - i. RE Michelle Munger, candidate under care, no advisor recorded. Mtg. 6, p.4, 1.17.04. **G. 11-2E**, *Acts of Assembly* 06-08.
 - j. No term of service or area of responsibility specified for TE Michael Johnson. Also confusing that the floor examination (5/7/1:14) was separate from the other details in the MC report. Mtg. 5, p.8, 1.15.06.01. **G. 10-5, 10-6**, *Acts of Assembly* 02-04.
 - k. No details on the retirement of TE Mark Jumper. Mtg. 6, p.4, 1.17.02. **G. 15**.
 - l. No election of moderator and stated clerk. Mtg. 5, Mtg. 6. **G. 19-3**.

- m. The scattered reporting of candidates examined, although the candidates were CPs, makes it difficult to assess. I did not see (perhaps I missed it) the churches the CPs are called to. All the aspects of the exams should be reported under the ministerial committee and each candidates' exam should be reported separately. Very confusing and hard to follow. Mtg. 7, p. 8, 1.26-1.27. **G.** 12-2 through 5, **G.** 13-1 through 7, **G.** 19-4B1-7, **G.** 21-1A.2, **G.** 21-1C.2.b.
 - n. Presbyteries shall submit signed copies of their approved minutes for all meetings of the completed calendar year to the General Assembly no later than March 1 of the following year. Minutes for meeting #7 submitted on April 2, 2025. **G.** 19-5D, *Rules for Assembly* 9-12G.1.
2. The Committee will forward the following **notations requiring response** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Coastal Mid-Atlantic Presbytery.
- a. No attendance record shown. Breakdown of TEs, REs and Guests listed, but no names of attendees or churches shown. Minutes state that attendance attached, but no such attachment was found. No distinction of associate members. Mtg. 5, p.1, 10:04, Mtg. 6, p.1, 1:04, Mtg. 7, attachment 7. *Acts of Assembly* 00-11, *Acts of Assembly* 03-04.14.
 - b. No budget or audit reported, financial summaries only. Mtg. 5, Mtg. 6. *Rules for Assembly* IX 9-12, **G.** 16.
 - c. Meetings 5, 6, and 7 all started with page #1. Mtg. 5, Mtg. 6, Mtg. 7. *Acts of Assembly* 98-05 and 05-08 #4, *Acts of Assembly* 16-25.
3. The Committee will forward the following **notations** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Coastal Mid-Atlantic Presbytery.
- a. No attendance roster. Mtg 5 - Excused TE's were listed in 1.15.03, but their church was not listed. Mtg. 5, Mtg. 6. *Acts of Assembly* 00-11.
 - b. Verbal reports were followed by a motion to receive the report. Mtg 5, multiple sections. A motion & vote to receive a report is, technically, not necessary.
 - c. A PCA church plant was received "as a release from the PCA". No documentation from PCA about the transfer was referenced. Mtg 5, p.5, 1.04.01. The Operating Guidelines in the Stated Clerk's Handbook states in #5: "Presbyteries dismiss to and receive from other presbyteries or ecclesiastical bodies. "Transfer" is the term for the completed transaction. If one party has not completed the transaction, then the Minutes should reflect that the action is pending, and subsequent minutes reflect that the action has been completed. *Acts of Assembly* 05-08."
 - d. The vote to sustain TE Michael Johnson exam was done by "secrete ballot". No count of the vote was recorded. Mtg. 5, p.8, 1.14.04. A secrete ballot's count should be made public to the Presbytery and recorded in the minutes. Only the count, not who counted how "overwhelmingly approved" is not a count.
 - e. Section 1.15.02 is an Omnibus motion. The next 3 sections – 03, 04, 05 are the omnibus items included in the Omnibus motion. Those 3 items should be sub-sections under 1.15.02, not separate full sections. Mtg. 5, p.8, 1.15.02, 03, 04, 05. General section format layout should be: 1.15.02, 1.15.02.01, 1.15.02.02, 1.15.02.03.
 - f. Page numbering was not continuous from meeting to meeting. Mtg. 5, Mtg. 6. *Acts of Assembly* 16-25.

- g. Omnibus Motion: only included excusing 6 TE's (apparently excused absence but that was not specifically mentioned). The absent TE's churches were not recorded. The text of the motion was "including a Motion to Excuse". What else was part of the omnibus motion? The following sections did not appear to be part of the omnibus motion. Mtg. 6, p.4, 1.17.01.
 - h. These sections followed the Omnibus motion at 1.17.01 but did not include approval. Since 1.17.01 was approved, it was not clear that 1.17.02 & 1.17.03 were part of the omnibus motion. 1.17.04 was an introduction of a Candidate coming under care & included approval of the Candidate. These are not typically part of an omnibus motion. Mtg. 6, p.4, 1.17.02, 1.17.03. Typical format for an omnibus motion would be: 1.17 – introduction of the omnibus motion, 1.17.01 – point 1 of the omnibus motion, 1.17.02 – point 2 of the omnibus motion, 1.17.03 – point 3 of the omnibus motion. After all the points were read, a motion & vote to approve the omnibus motion would be taken.
 - i. Section numbering system started over each day of the meeting, same section numbers in both days. Mtg. 5, Mtg. 6. Section numbering should be continuous for the entire meeting, however many days the meeting runs.
 - j. The section numbering system was very helpful to separate topics, but some confusion remains: 1.18 = Church Development Team Report, Some of the 6 sections below that: .01, .02, .03, .04, .05, .06 don't seem to be a part of Church Development, such as: .02 – Women's Ministry, .03 - Church Planting Network, .04 - World Outreach Report, .06 - Media & Communications Report. Mtg. 6, p.6, Starting with section 1.18. Sub-sections should be part of the main section.
 - k. Stewardship Committee Report included "Stewardship Committee has examined the Presbytery financial records and the accounting documents and have determined that the PCMA is correctly accounting for all income and expenses for the Presbytery". Mtg. 6, p.6, 1.19. An audit or Review of finances should be done by other than the Finance team. When using 'internal' auditors/reviewers, they should be reporting directly to Presbytery Leadership, not the Finance Team.
4. General advice to the presbytery
None
5. Commendation
The stated clerk recorded that the meeting had reached parity the first day of the meeting! 27 TE's & 54 RE's (plus 28 observers). On the 2nd day, parity was 34 TE's, 59 RE's (plus 30 observers). Less than Parity. Mtg. 5, first day. Wow – Wow – I've never attended a Presbytery meeting that met parity between TE's & RE's. 2nd day was close at 73.5%. Still! More people on the 2nd day!

East

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Presbytery of the East be approved with the following *exceptions*.
 - a. No definite period listed for TE Nathan Cotton, TE Isaiah Nengean, and TE Jay Lee, Assistant Pastors. Mtg. 130, p.11-13, p.15, 130-14E and 14I. **G.** 10-6 A.
 - b. No definite period listed for TE Anthony Bianchini and TE Art Lindsley Out of Bounds. Mtg. 130, p.14, 130-14I. **G.** 10-8 B.2.a.

- c. The minutes were not signed by the Moderator. Mtg. 130 and Mtg. 131, last pages. **G.** 19-5 D.
 - d. 6 TE and 4 RE on Ministerial Committee not within 1 of each other. Mtg. 131, p.7, 131-12B, Mtg. 132, p.7, 132-13A. **G.** 21-2 A.
 - e. No mention of election of Moderator. Mtg. 129, Mtg. 130, Mtg. 131, and Mtg. 132. **G.** 19-3 A.
 - f. No Parity list provided to make sure there are 2 RE for each TE. Mtg. 130, Mtg. 131, and Mtg. 132. **G.** 19-2 A.4b, *Acts of Assembly* 05-08 3.
 - g. There is no record in the Minutes that Candidates coming under Care 6-month minimum membership in an EPC church. Mtg. 130, p.10, 130-14C, Mtg. 131, p.8, 131-12D. **G.** 11-2A.
 - h. There is no record in the Minutes that the Presbytery has received Endorsement forms from church sessions for Candidates coming under Care. Mtg. 130, p.10, 14-C, Mtg. 131, p.8, 131-12D. **G.** 11-2A and Attachment 7, Procedure Manual.
 - i. There is no record in the Minutes that Candidates coming under Care were assigned an advisor. Mtg. 130, p.11, 14-C. **G.** 11-2E.
 - j. There is no record in the Minutes that the process of the dissolution of a local church or mission church was followed. Mtg. 132, p.29, 132-18B. **G.** 5-9.
 - k. There is no record in the Minutes that the 132nd Meeting was closed in prayer. Mtg. 132, p.32, 132-29. **G.** 16-1A.
 - l. There is no record in the Minutes listing the members of the Ministerial Committee. "Minutes must report the membership of the Ministerial Committee....to define for that year that its ratio of Teacher Elders to Ruling Elders meets the requirements of **G.** 21-2 for that Committee." Mtg. 130, Mtg. 131, and Mtg. 132. **G.** 21-2.
2. The Committee will forward the following ***notations requiring response*** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Presbytery of the East.
- a. Page numbering does not correspond to meeting number. NOTE - last year they did. Mtg. 130, Mtg. 131, and Mtg. 132. *Acts of Assembly* 16-25.
 - b. Minutes shall list the names of each Teaching Elder member of the Presbytery and note that person's attendance as present, excused, or unexcused. NOTE - Google Drive is not a substitute for this requirement. Mtg. 130, p.5, 130-08, Mtg. 130, Mtg. 131, and Mtg. 132, Mtg. 131, p.3, 131-04, Mtg. 132, p.30/ 132-21E. *Acts of Assembly* 00-11.
 - c. When recording a Presbytery vote on a Descending Overture(s) the Minutes should include a summary of that Overture(s) as described on the official ballot received from the General Assembly. Mtg. 130, p.18, 130-19D. *Acts of Assembly* 07-08.
 - d. 2024 Budget not in Minutes. It is indicated that it is on a Google Drive. Mtg. 129, p.7, 129-19. *Rules for Assembly* IX 9-12 **G.** 16.
 - e. Complete Ministerial Committee Report available on Google Drive is not a substitute for a report given live at each meeting of the Presbytery. Mtg. 130, p.10, 130-14.
 - f. The Stated Clerks Report should be included in the Minutes, not on Google Drive. Mtg. 130, p.17, 130-91.

3. The Committee will forward the following *notations* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Presbytery of the East.
 - a. Spelling error: Fourth, not Forth concerning Jules Grisham. Mtg. 130, p.15, 130-14I.
 - b. Verb tense wrong: examined instead of examining in last sentence for GE Hildebrand. Mtg. 132, p.19, 132-13Q.
 - c. The clerk is advise to adopt the practice of showing the role broken out by churches with TE and RE listed for those churches.
 - d. Normally the Stated Clerk determines that a Quorum is present. Mtg. 130, p.1, 130-04, Mtg. 131, p.1, 131-04, Mtg. 132, p.1, 132-04.
 - e. The Presbytery Review Committee has been charged with tracking the attendance of both TE and member churches (shown through RE attendance). The TE Attendance Report in Minutes of the Presbytery of the East does not allow for that tracking. The absent TE's are listed without church name and without corresponding RE attendance. Mtg. 130, Mtg. 131, and Mtg. 132.
 - f. The first read of the Descending Overture from GA should be contained in the Minutes of the Presbytery. Mtg. 132, p.30, 132-21D.
 - g. Typo - in the Minutes of the 132nd Meeting it list the TE's absent from the 130th Meeting. 132-21E TE Absences. The following Teaching Elders (TEs) advised they would be absent from the 130th Stated Meeting. Mtg. 132, 30-21E.
4. General advice to the presbytery
None
5. Commendation
Well written and concise. These minutes are a lot more complete than the 2023 minutes.

Florida

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Florida and Caribbean Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*.
 - a. No primary responsibilities or definite period listed for TE Charles Ruelke, TE Jude Vilma, and TE Brian Eida as Assistant Pastors. Mtg. 101, p.10-11, 101.13, Mtg. 101, p.12, 101.16, Mtg. 102, p.18-21, 102.19. **G.** 10-6 A.
 - b. REs for Admin Commission for TE Zachary McIntosh need to come from at least 2 churches. The TEs came from different churches. Mtg. 101, p.13, 101.16. **G.** 9-6a
 - c. No definite period listed for TE Mike Jones, TE Eric McEwan, and TE John Quigley for out of bounds position. Mtg. 102, p.11, 102.12 omnibus motion 02, Mtg. 102, p.14-17, 102.12, Mtg. 103, p.11, 103.12 omnibus motion 4. **G.** 10-8 B.2.a.
 - d. No primary responsibilities listed for TE Lou Kaloger Associate Pastor and TE Charlie Halleran Associate Pastor. Mtg. 102, p.12, 102.12. **G.** 10-5.
 - e. Purpose of Called meeting not stated. 10th Called Meeting, p.1, 10.01. **G.** 19-5 B

2. The Committee will forward the following ***notations requiring response*** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Florida and Caribbean Presbytery.
 - a. No listing of Session Minutes being reviewed by church name. Mtg. 102, p.18, 102.18, Mtg. 103, p.13, 103.18. *Rules for Assembly* 9-12 **G. 9, Acts of Assembly** 07-08.
3. The Committee will forward the following ***notations*** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Florida and Caribbean Presbytery.
 - a. Paragraph numbers shown as 100.14 to 100.16 should be 101.14 to 101.16. Mtg. 101, p.11-12, 100.14-100.16. Paragraphs mislabeled.
 - b. Need “y” added to Presbyter in motion for Josh Hammans. Mtg. 103, p.6, 103.05. Misspelling.
4. General advice to the presbytery
None
5. Commendation
Like the Disaster Relief charter. Seems very appropriate for your Presbytery. All churches attended at least one Presbytery meeting.

Great Plains

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Great Plains Presbytery be approved with the following ***exceptions***:
 - a. No differentiation between active, inactive, and retired in the rolls. Mtg. 31, p.648 and p.650-654. Mtg. 32, p.1-5. Mtg. 33, p.662 and p.665. **G. 19-2. Acts of Assembly** 05-08
 - b. Membership of Ministerial Committee not reported. Mtg. 31, Mtg.32, Mtg. 33. **G. 21-2.**
2. The Committee will forward the following ***notations requiring response*** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Great Plains Presbytery.
 - a. City and call to order time not recorded. Mtg. 31-33, *Rules for Assembly* 9-12G.1; *Acts of Assembly* 88-02.
3. The Committee will forward the following ***notations*** to Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Great Plains Presbytery.
 - a. Corresponding members were not given privilege of the floor. Mtg. 31, p.648, 31:02.D, Mtg. 32, p.1, 32:02.D. *Acts of Assembly* 03-04.4.
 - b. Parity: “Approved the 2024 Parity” but no churches were listed to send additional RE’s. Mtg. 31, p.648, Omnibus Motion .5, & 31:03.C. **G. 19-2A.4b, Acts of Assembly** 05-08.3.
 - c. Overture 43A had a rationale for approval but not a summary of the overture. Overture 43B had a rationale for approval but not a summary of the overture. Mtg. 31, p.643, 31:03. *Acts of Assembly* 07-08.3.
 - d. 2024 parity approved. Parity not shown in the minutes. Mtg. 31, p.648, 02.E.5. **G. 19-2A.4b, Acts of Assembly** 05-08.
 - e. Session Records Review: 25 minutes received “review is almost completed” but no list of churches whose minutes have been reviewed. (Also listed churches who had NOT sent in their minutes). Mtg. 31, p.655, 31:10, Mtg. 32, p.5, 32:03, Mtg. 33, p.669, 33:11. *Acts of Assembly* 07-08.

- f. Approval of the previous minutes only referenced the date “24.1.28”, not the meeting number. (the previous meeting was held on January 26, 27, not 28). Mtg. 32, p.1, Omnibus Motion. Although the date is helpful, the meeting number being approved should be recorded.
4. General advice to the presbytery
None
5. Commendation to the presbytery
Overall, very good.

Gulf South

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Gulf South Presbytery be approved with the following **exceptions**:
 - a. Minutes must report actions of Commissions but not include the entire report. Mtg. 29, p.183-184, 29.09, Mtg. 30, p.198-199, 30.07-08. **G.** 21-1 A.2.
 - b. No mention that candidates Mansfield and Oh were examined by the Presbytery. Mtg. 29, p.185, 29.12. **G.** 11-2 C.
 - c. No closing prayer. Mtg. 30, p.206, 30.17. **G.** 16-1 A.
 - d. No definite period listed for TE Miguel Broche as Assistant Pastor. Mtg. 31, p.222, 31.21 6. **G.** 10-6 A.
2. The Committee will forward the following **notations requiring response** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Gulf South Presbytery.
 - a. Minutes should include a Summary of Descending Motions as described in the official ballot when voted on. Mtg. 29, p.190-191, 29.20. *Acts of Assembly* 07-08.
 - b. Minutes shall list the names of each Teaching Elder member of the Presbytery and note that person’s attendance as present, excused or unexcused. Mtg. 29, p.179, 29.02. *Acts of Assembly* 00-11.
 - c. There is no record in the Minutes of audited or reviewed statements of financial position. Mtg. 29, Mtg. 30, and Mtg. 31. *Acts of Assembly* 07-09
3. The Committee will forward the following **notations** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Gulf South Presbytery.
 - a. Typo - “Reid Robertson, student supply for Vernal should read Stated. Mtg. 30, p.199, 30.08.
4. General advice to the presbytery
None
5. Commendations
Good job, well written and organized.

Mid-America

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Mid-America Presbytery be approved with the following **exceptions**:
 - a. None
2. The Committee will forward the following **notations requiring response** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Mid-America Presbytery.
 - a. None

3. The Committee will forward the following **notations** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Mid-America Presbytery.
 - a. Change of Terms of Call or First time Terms of Call? It is unclear if this is a change in Rev. Michael Morefield's terms of call or new terms of call for him. If they are new, was this part of an examination? 99, pg. 18 (1519), 99.13.2. *Acts of Assembly* 12-11.1, *Acts of Assembly* 12-11.2
4. General advice to the presbytery
None
5. Commendation
Excellent organization, details and very careful recording. Well done and easy to read. Thank you for your efforts.

Midwest

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Midwest Presbytery be approved with the following **exceptions**:
 - a. Approve move of TE Ian Leslie to the Retired Roll (active or inactive?). The minutes must report all the steps for retiring TE's. Mtg. 181, p.12, **G.** 15-1.
 - b. A motion was made and approved in an Executive Session. "An Executive Session may be used for the discussion of sensitive and/or confidential topics but any motions resulting from such discussion by the presbytery must be done in an open session so that the action may be recorded in the Minutes of the meeting. Mtg. 182, p.14, 01. **G.** 2-4A.
 - c. There is no record of the period of time for the call of Assistant Pastor TE Ferguson. Mtg. 182, p.9, 182-01. **G.** 10-6A.
 - d. There is no record of a congregational meeting to concur on the dissolution of the calls of TE Jerry Van Auken, TE Briyan Gregory, TE Kevin Chen, TE Jeremy McNeill, TE Brandon LaFontaine and TE Josh Boehr Mtg. 181, p.11, 181-15, Mtg. 182, p.11, 182-07, Mtg. 183, p.620, 20. **G.** 14-1A.
 - e. There is no record of the process for dismissing a local church. Mtg. 182, p.11.08, **G.** 5-9.
 - f. There is no record in the Minutes that the Presbytery reviewed any of the member churches Session Minutes. Mtg. 181, Mtg. 182, and Mtg. 183. *Acts of Assembly* 07-08.
2. The Committee will forward the following **notations requiring response** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Midwest Presbytery.
 - a. TE Elder Rich Lanning is not named as "Moderator". Mtg. 181, p.533, 181-01. **G.** 19-5B.
 - b. Terms of Call for Jason Huff have no signatures of Clerk of Session, Chairman of Search Committee, Moderator of Congregational meeting. Mtg. 181, Attachment, ??
 - c. Since you provide Financial Reporting and other related information as "Attachments", you need to make sure that the signature page follows at the end of the last Attachment. This was not the case in every meeting. Mtg. 182, p.28.
 - d. Removing TE Scott Bearer and TE Luke Potter from membership in the MWP (at their request). No details listed. Should be a reason listed. Are they renouncing

jurisdiction? Retiring? Moving to a non-EPC church? Mtg. 182, p.10, Omnibus Motion #1

- e. A very brief letter of a financial review was attached. There was no explanation of the reviewer's relationship with the Finance Team. Use of an 'in-house' financial reviewer is permitted as an 'Audit'. The reviewer(s) should not be members of, or family members of, the Finance Team, in order to preclude a conflict of interest. Mtg. 182, p.12, 182-08.
3. The Committee will forward the following **notations** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Midwest Presbytery.
 - a. "A total of 97 commissioners were present" "additional 20 commissioners and guests signed in online". Mtg. 181, p.553, 181-02. RE's are usually referred to as "Commissioners". "TE's are just TE's. My assumption, in this statement, is that "commissioners" means both TE's & RE's. It would be helpful to use the terms "RE's & TE's", if that was what you intended. G. 19-2 "Membership of Presbytery": TE's are referred to as TE's. RE's are Commissioners.
 - b. No mention of parity. Count of TE's present & Commissioners (including Zoom attendees) averaged 48% for all 3 meetings. Target is 67% (1:2). Mtg. 181 and Mtg. 182. *Acts of Assembly* 05-08.3.
 - c. There were several TE's who were retired, Without Call, Inactive, Active, Out of Bounds & Associate. These were all listed as 'Present' but not enrolled as corresponding members with the privilege of the floor. Mtg. 181 and Mtg. 182. *Acts of Assembly* 03-04.4, (Associates) *Acts of Assembly* 05-08.
 - d. No mention of "recessing the meeting" - It was noted that the meeting "reconvened". Mtg. 181, p.182-183.
 - e. Approving the dissolution of the relationship of TE Kevin Chen (Assistant Pastor of Knox EPC, Ann Arbor, MI) and moving him to the Pastors Without Call roll of the MWP Presbytery. Mtg. 182, p.10 – Omnibus Motion, G. 14-1A & B.
4. General advice to the presbytery
None
5. Commendation
Well organized (with a few exceptions noted) with section numbers.

New River

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the New River Presbytery be approved with the following **exceptions**:
 - a. None
2. The Committee will forward the following **notations requiring response** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the New River Presbytery.
 - a. None
3. The Committee will forward the following **notations** to Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the New River Presbytery.
 - a. None
4. General advice to the presbytery
None

5. Commendation

Very good minutes, easy to follow and see the actions of the Presbytery. Well done on the inclusion of a sermon preached and dealing with judicial processes. Thank you for your efforts.

Pacific Northwest

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Pacific Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*.
 - a. No record in the Minutes that Dissolution of Calls for purposes of retirement were approved at a congregational meeting. Mtg. 20, p.396, 20-34, Mtg. 21, p.419, 21-35. **G.** 14-1B.
 - b. Retirements: TE George Dakin: Dissolve call & transfer to Retired role (Active) TE Mark Toone: Dissolve call & transfer to Retired role (Active) TE Dennis Yeung, (Institutional) EPCPNW Chaplain TE Ehud Garcia, Community Presbyterian Church of Onalaska, WA. Only approved a motion to dissolve their church relationship & transfer to retired role (Inactive & Active status). All required steps must be listed. Mtg. 20, p.396, 20-34, Mtg. 21, p.419, 21-35. **G.** 15.1B.
2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring response* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Pacific Presbytery.
 - a. None
3. The Committee will forward the following *notations* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Pacific Presbytery.
 - a. Incorrect filling in of report of vote on Descending Overture. "Balloting was conducted at the meeting of the "21st" Presbytery. It should read "Pacific Northwest Presbytery". Mtg. 21, p.413, 21-21.
 - b. No mention of meeting recessing overnight. However, it is written that the meeting was "recalled/reconvened". Mtg. 19, Mtg. 20, and Mtg. 21.
4. General advice to the presbytery
None
5. Commendation
Well written and concise. Landscape format documents were scanned in landscape format in the submitted minutes, making them much easier to read on-line! (these are often scanned in the portrait position). Financial reports were very complete and easily readable.

Pacific Southwest

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Pacific Southwest Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*.
 - a. None
2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring response* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Pacific Southwest Presbytery.
 - a. None

3. The Committee will forward the following *notations* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Pacific Southwest Presbytery.
 - a. C2-5 is titled “Exam of Donny Butkus” but is actually the “Exam of Marcos Ortega”. Called Meeting July 13, 2024, item C2-5.
 - b. In the report on the examinations of Candidates Gold and Beard the pronouns used changed from masculine singular to gender neutral plural (he-him to they their.). This appears to be a “copy and paste” situation. Care should be taken to ensure consistency. Mtg. 20, p.316-317, 20-30.
 - c. TE Burke’s and TE Bottomly’s status at meeting not indicated. Mtg. 19, p.283-284, 19-2.
4. General advice to the Presbytery
None
5. Commendation
None

Rivers and Lakes

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Rivers and Lakes Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*:
 - a. None
2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring response* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Rivers and Lakes Presbytery.
 - a. None
3. The Committee will forward the following *notations* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Rivers and Lakes Presbytery.
 - a. None
4. General advice to the presbytery
None
5. Commendations
Well done minutes in good order and with clarity and understandable. Thanks for doing a good job recording how God is working in the Presbytery of Rivers and Lakes.

Southeast

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the Southeast Presbytery be approved with the following *exceptions*:
 - a. No Notation of Opening with Prayer. No Notation of Closing with Prayer Mtg. 121, p.293, 121-01. Mtg. 123, p.370, 123-26. **G.** 16-1A, *Rules for Assembly* 9-12G2.
 - b. TE Fischler was received as a member of the presbytery however his status is not noted – Pastor, Teacher, Evangelist, etc. Mtg. 122, p.328-329, 122-11.4. **G.** 9-5A-E.
2. The Committee will forward the following *notations requiring response* to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the Southeast Presbytery.
 - a. No notation for the Signing of Ministerial Obligation Form by Paul Landon. No notation for the Signing of Ministerial Obligation Form by Lance Lewis. No

notation for the Signing of Ministerial Obligation Form by Bruce A. Lowe. Mtg. 122, p.331, 333, 122-15.1, 122-15.2, Mtg. 123, p.362, 123-08.(5). **G.** 19-4B4. *Acts of Assembly* 98-04.

- b. Motion is noted for terminating candidates Hannah Sikes Andreades and Matthew Bullard, but it is not noted if it was approved or not approved. Mtg. 122, p.335, 122-18.2. **G.** 19-5D.
3. The Committee will forward the following **notations** to Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the Southeast Presbytery.
 - a. Number missing for the Examination – Pastor from Another Reformed Denomination – Bruce A. Lowe, should be 123-08.5 and then the numbers following are one more higher. Mtg. 123, p.361, 123-08.(5).
4. General advice to the presbytery
None
5. Commendation
It was a joy to read about Resurrection Chattanooga and to pray for each of the charter members by name.

West

1. The Committee recommends that the Minutes of the West Presbytery be approved with the following **exceptions**:
 - a. The names of churches whose session's minutes have been reviewed are not recorded. Mtg. 132, p.4, 132-5D. **G.** 19-4A7, *Acts of Assembly* 07-08.
 - b. Members of the Ministerial Commission are not listed. Mtg. 131, p.6, 131.6. **G.** 21-2.
2. The Committee will forward the following **notations requiring response** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the minutes of the West Presbytery.
 - a. No analysis of the TE/RE ratios for attendance or spread for additional RE's. Mtg. 131, p.1 & ff, 131.2. *Acts of Assembly* 05-08.
 - b. No indication of more than one church represented on the Ordination Commission for Candidate Andrew Vang also for TE Dave Meserve. Mtg. 132, p.14, 132.17, Mtg. 133, p.10, 133.14. **G.** 13-1A, **G.** 21-1C.2b.
 - c. Approval of terms of call for TE McNeill not recorded. Mtg. 131, p.6, 131.6. *Acts of Assembly* 12-11.1.
 - d. Pages of 2nd Called meeting are not numbered. Called meeting April 8, 2024. *Acts of Assembly* 16-25.
3. The Committee will forward the following **notations** to the Stated Clerk of the General Assembly regarding the Minutes of the West Presbytery.
 - a. When recording a Presbytery vote on a Descending Overture the Minutes should include a summary of the Overture as described by the GA. Mtg. 131, p.4, 131.3. *Acts of Assembly* 07-08.
 - b. There is no reference G21-2D.2.f. Did you mean .2.e or .1.f? Mtg. 131, p.5, 131.5 (E,H,I). **G.** 21-2D.2
 - c. It is strongly recommended that the clerk follow the defined scheme for reporting the attendance of each church in the presbytery as defined in the Presbytery Stated Clerk's Handbook. (available from the GA office on request).

4. General advice to the presbytery

None

5. Commendation

None

Committee members for this Presbytery Review Committee for 2025 include:


RE Ron Bengelink	Presbytery of the Pacific Northwest
RE Jane Bodden	Presbytery of Florida & the Caribbean
RE Jim Conners	Presbytery of the Pacific Southwest
RE Keith Hopkins	Presbytery of the Pacific Northwest
RE Ray Kinat	Presbytery of the Alleghenies
TE George King	Presbytery of the Gulf South
TE Jason Steele	Presbytery of the Midwest
TE Mark Willems	Presbytery of the Pacific Northwest

Meeting Dates:

March 7, 2025: Video Conference
March 18, 2025: (Subcommittee) Video Conference
March 20, 2025: (Subcommittee) Video Conference
March 25, 2025: (Subcommittee) Video Conference
March 27, 2025: (Subcommittee) Video Conference
April 1, 2025: (Subcommittee) Video Conference
April 3, 2025: (Subcommittee) Video Conference
April 8, 2025: (Subcommittee) Video Conference
April 10, 2025: (Subcommittee) Video Conference
April 24, 2025: Video Conference

The Committee reviewed and approved these minutes on Apr. 24, 2025


Ron Bengelink, Committee Chair


Vanessa Mullendore, recording Clerk